

Integrated Management Model for Jerusalem: The Peace of Center for War Center

Sülün Evinç Torlak (Prof. Dr.)

Figen Keskin (PhD Candidate - Lecturer)

Pamukkale University Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences
Department of Political Science and Public Administration, Turkey

Abstract

Jerusalem is one of the world's oldest cities and is considered as the center of the World. The city is considered holy in three great divine religions. "Many things that are sacred to Judaism and Christianity, is based in most of the sacred and common holiness of Jerusalem to Islam". Coexistence of different religious groups in the city, causes the fight to ensure the domination. Core reason of inability for sharing Jerusalem: Christian, Jewish and Muslim neighbourhoods and they can not be distinguished sharply from each other sanctuary. While the aforementioned three religions basically take peace and reconciliation as a basis, Jerusalem has become a center of war, blood and suffering throughout its history. No culture or religion could achieve complete control. This situation causes that the important sacred religious heritages of the three religions remain under threat. And even when dominance has been achieved for a while, the threat continues. The powerful ones will not respect for the sacred values of others. The city is considered as one of the city's in World heritages in danger by UNESCO and being in this status is not sufficient for the protection of this most important holy city in the World. Ensuring and sustaining absolute peace for Jerusalem is required. Jerusalem must be a city of peace. This can be achieved with common sense and an integrated management. In this study, it is emphasized that Jerusalem can be the center of the world peace and an integrated management model is proposed

Keywords: Jerusalem, Holy City, Integrated Management

Introduction

Jerusalem located in the Middle East is the oldest city in the World. It lies between the Mediterranean Sea and the north boundary of the Dead Sea. Israel and Palestine claim Jerusalem as their capital. In 2017 Jerusalem with East Jerusalem has a population 890.000 or above 1.000.000 and its area is

125. 1 km (<http://worldpopulationreview.com/countries/israel-population/>). Mediterranean climate reigns in the city. The most important problem of the city subsequent to the ongoing wars throughout its whole history is the water scarcity. Old Jerusalem became one of the World Heritage Sites in 1981. The city is on the list of “World Heritages in Danger”.

A city called “Rušalim” is mentioned in the texts of the Kingdom of Egypt and In old Hebrew this city is known as Jerusalem (Yerushalayim) (Lapierre and Collins, 1994:32). Jerusalem is mentioned as 'Urušalimin' in the Amarna Letters which are the most important samples of “cuneiform scripts culture” of the Old Near East in the 14th century BC. In Arabic, (Quds-i Sherif) Jerusalem means “The Holy” or “The Holy Sanctuary”. The Muslims called the city as “Madinat Bayt al Maqdis” (City of The Temple). The city has two parts. East part of it was called as Shalem and west part of it where altar is located was called as Moriah. Abraham named west part of it as “Yiru” (Jeru) meaning awe. When its two parts united, it got the name of JeruSalem. Yerushalayim first appears in the Bible, in the Book of Joshua. The name is a combination of Yireh (God will see to it) and Shalim (The God – Name of the God). The word “Shalim” used as Shalom (in Hebrew) and Salam (in Arabic) also mean “peace” and Yerushalayim means “The City of Peace”.

In Hebrew tablets Jerusalem was stated as “A snake or scorpion injured no one in Jerusalem”. But in this sacred city where snakes and scorpions injure no one, people shed blood throughout the history. No one of the three monotheistic religions (namely Judaism, Christianity and Islam) has ever attain complete domination over Jerusalem which is a commonly holy and important city for them. Today, Jerusalem is the focal point of the Israeli – Palestinian conflict. Capture of Jerusalem by one of them means that the city is under threat. The most sacred values and sanctuaries of each three religions are located in it. The sanctuaries are mixed each other and they cannot be separated. Thus the communities will live together in Jerusalem and achieve the peace together. All the religions advise human beings “the Peace”. If the humankind can't achieve the peace in Jerusalem, the world peace can never be achieved. This is a challenge for the humankind.

From this point of view in this study, a management model based on the peace and coexistence is proposed. Historical background of the city is examined, the problems are analyzed under the four main headings, opinions of the parties and the other nations are included and solution proposals of the international organizations are dealt with. In the light of compiled information, an integrated Jerusalem management model is proposed and in the framework of this model conversion achievability of Jerusalem into a Peace City is discussed.

History of Jerusalem – History of the War

While seeking reconciliation in Jerusalem, 5000-year history of the city must be reviewed. Long history of Jerusalem has essentially become a history of wars, struggles and pain. The city has been completely destroyed twice, occupied 23 times, attacked 52 times and captured 44 times. History of the war must be looked at when the city of peace is designed.

Ancient Period

First human being: It is believed that Adam lived in Jerusalem after he was banished from the heaven. Abraham built an altar to sacrifice his son Isaac. The altar in Jerusalem remained until the Noah's Flood and Noah rebuilt it after the Flood. Jerusalem was inherited by Noah's son Shem. Shem and his descendants lived in Jerusalem. They taught God's orders there. The city expanded and Shem became the king and he was granted the title of "Honest King".

First Settlement: According to the archeologists there was life in the city in the Copper Age and there was settlement in the city in the Bronze Age. First settlement was in 4000s BC. In the late Bronze Age, the city was an Egyptian vassal city-state. This Egyptian garrison developed in the period of Ramesses. In this period Canaan Region formed part of the Egyptian Empire.

The First Temple Period: In 10th century BC, King David united the twelve tribes and established the United Kingdom of Israel and he captured Jerusalem which then he made it the capital of the Kingdom. Solomon, son of the King David, built the Holy Temple in 970 BC. The First Temple was the most important center of Jewish worship. Upon Solomon's death the Kingdom of Israel split. Jerusalem remained as the capital of the Kingdom of Judah for more than 400 years. Jerusalem was invaded by Assyrians in 722 BC and by Babylonians in 587 BC. Babylonians destroyed Jerusalem and they expelled the Jews from Jerusalem.

The Second Temple Period: In 538 BC the Persians captured the city and allowed the Jews to return to Jerusalem to rebuild the Temple. In 516 BC, Jerusalem resumed its role as the center of Jewish worship. The city was conquered by the Macedonians under the command of Alexander the Great and then Jerusalem and Judea came under the control of the Hellenic Kingdom. In 198 BC, Jerusalem turned into a Hellenized city-state. In 168 BC, Hasmonean Kingdom was established and it made Jerusalem its capital.

Roman Period: In 63 BC, Romans captured Jerusalem (Aytürk, 2011: 100). Judae remained between the Roman Empire and Parthian Empire. As Rome became stronger, Jerusalem became an affiliated kingdom of Jerusalem, the Temple was expanded, the city developed and it became the capital of the Roman province. In AD 70, the second Temple was destroyed

in Jewish revolt. Hadrian, the Roman Emperor, recaptured the city and renamed it as “Aelia Capitolina”. Jews could enter the city once a year.

Middle Ages

Byzantine Period: The Byzantine Emperor made Jerusalem a Christian city in 4th century CE (Aytürk, 2011:103). Even if the Jews were prohibited from entering the city, the population of Jerusalem reached 200.000. The Byzantines ruled the city for a long time, Jerusalem remained between the Byzantine and the Persians for a while and the Sassanians captured Jerusalem for a short time. But Byzantine recaptured the city each time (629 CE)).

Early Islamic Period: The Muslims captured Jerusalem from the Byzantine (620 CE), Jews were allowed to enter the city and the Caliph Umar assured that Christians and their holy places would be protected⁷. Al-Aqsa Mosque, the first mosque of the city, was built. The Dome of the Rock with its grandeur dome was built in the late 7th century CE. The city was captured by various tribes and Jerusalem’s prominence gradually diminished.

The Crusaders and The Ayyubids Period: The Fatimids expelled Christians from Jerusalem. Thus the crusades started (1096 – 1272), The Crusaders who made an extensive massacre established the Kingdom of Jerusalem. In 1187 the city was captured from the Crusaders by Saladin Ayyubid who allowed Jews and Muslims to return to the city. Although the Ayyubids constructed new buildings, Jerusalem’s prominence vanished. Jerusalem was captured and sacked by Khwarezmian Tatars. Then the city was recaptured by the Ayyubids. From 1250 to 1517 Jerusalem was ruled by the Mamluks and they fought with the Crusaders for the city for many years.

New Era

The Ottoman Period (1517 – 1917): The Ottomans captured the city and ruled it for 400 years (Ataöv, 1980:34). The city was again an important center of worship. In 1744 Jerusalem became the capital of Palestine. The period of Suleiman the Magnificent rule was the “Peace Period”. The Ottomans brought many innovations: the city developed and many historical buildings were built, walls and roads constructed and a postal system was formed. With the annexation of Jerusalem by the Egypt in 1831, the Arabs revolted and the revolt was suppressed and in 1840 the Ottoman rule was reinstated. In 1850s the international powers started to influence the minorities⁸. Christian population increased, 5000 – 6000 pilgrims visited the

⁷ The caliph Umar refused to pray in the church so that Muslims would not request conversion of the church to a mosque.

⁸ In the 19th century European Nations opened consulates to protect the holy places and churches and to increase their influence on Jerusalem.

city each year, new neighbourhoods emerged outside the Old City, the Russian Compound was founded. In 1860 in Palestine the first colony called as Petah-Tikva was formed. Then the Jewish properties in the region increased after the new colonies were formed and they expanded their territories (Armaoğlu, 1989:25). In 1874 Jerusalem became a special administrative district.

Modern Age

British Mandate Period (1917-1948): In 1917 Jerusalem was captured from the Ottomans by the British troops and then in 1922 it was transferred to the British Mandate by the League of Nations. The city was ruled under the British mandate until 1948 and then left to the authority of the state of Israel. As of 1930s Jewish migration from the Europe to Palestine region increased because of the Nazi policies. This situation caused an increase in the Arab – Israeli conflicts. In such an environment state of Israel was established in 1948 in West Jerusalem after the Second World War. The UN accepted that the State of Israel declared Jerusalem its capital.

The 1947 UN Jerusalem Partition Plan (Corpus Separatum): As a result of the conflicts the UN decided to divide the Palestine territories between the Arabs and Jews under the surveillance of the UN. With the Partition Plan Jerusalem was to be an international city which had specific special laws and a political status and was managed by no nations and organizations except the UN. The Jewish leaders accepted the Plan but the Arabs were opposed to it. Israel declared its independence (1948).

The 1948 Arab – Israeli War: After the State of Israel was created, the Arab invasion started and the war broke out. West part of Jerusalem lay under the control of Israel side and the east part of Jerusalem lay under the control of Jordan side (Khamaisi, 2007: 68) Upon the 1949 Armistice Agreement, Jerusalem was divided. A buffer zone, under the authority of no one, was created between the two territories. Thousands of people deserted their houses and 30.000 individuals became refugees. These two states recognized their mutual “de facto” rights though not officially. The Treaty wasn’t internationally recognized because it wasn’t appropriate for the proposal of “an International City” for Jerusalem. Israel declared Jerusalem as its inseparable part and eternal capital. It relocated all branches of Israeli government to Jerusalem except for the Ministry of Defense residing in Tel Aviv. At the time of proclamation as Jerusalem was divided West Jerusalem was proclaimed Israel’s capital. But the member states of the UN didn’t recognized Jerusalem as its capital and they didn’t move their embassies from Tel Aviv.

Jordan Attack in 1953: On 27 July 1953 The King Hussein of Jordan declared East Jerusalem his “Hashemite Kingdom’s alternative capital”. But

Amman continued to be the capital of Jordan. On 5 June 1967 Jordan troops started to bomb Mount Scopus and Ramat Rahel. After the troops of Hussein opened fire, control of Jordan part of the city was captured by Israel within two days and the city was included by the municipality borders. New Jewish suburbs were constructed at the old Jordan border in the 1949 armistice line (http://www.mefacts.com/cache/html/wall-ruling_/11362.htm). With its Resolution of 1967 (with the UN Security Council resolution numbered 242). the United Nations called Israel to “withdraw from the territories recently occupied” but Israel rejected it.

1980 Jerusalem Law: With Jerusalem Law, included into the Basic Law, Knesset annexed East Jerusalem and declared “United Jerusalem” municipality the capital of Israel sovereignty. The UN Security Council (Resolution numbered 478) didn’t accept the law and noted that “it had to be immediately cancelled because it was contrary to international laws”. Member states of the UN don’t have embassies in Jerusalem to impose sanction on Israel. In 1988 Jordan didn’t recognize the Israeli dominance over East Jerusalem but waived its rights on that territory.

Today Jerusalem persists as the most significant entity of the conflict between Palestine and Israel. In the city, struggles are always confronted and possibility of new battles are always continues

Analysis of the Problems

Protection of the Holy Places

Description of the Holy Jerusalem

Jerusalem is a holy city in the three major Abrahamic religions of Judaism, Christianity and Islam. In a small area in East Jerusalem and the Old City, Jerusalem accommodates adjacently many sites of these three religions such as the Temple Mount, Wailing Wall, al-Aqsa Mosque and Church of the Holy Sepulchre⁹.

Muslims: Jerusalem has been the third holy city for Islam for 1400 years. In Islam, Jerusalem in 610 CE became the first qibla. Al-aqsa mosque in Jerusalem is the third holiest masjid following “Kaaba in Mecca and al-Masjid an Nabawi in Medina” (El-Khatip, 2004: 111). The significance of the city for the Muslims is that the Prophet Muhammad made his Mi’raj Journey there. The stone ,namely the Dome of Rock (Qubbat As-Sakhrah) he stepped on when he ascends to Mi’raj and Al-aqsa Mosque are located there.

Jews: Jerusalem has been the holiest city for the Jews for 3000 years. The first Temple was built there. The Holy Temple: It is the center of Judaism and they visit the temple in Jewish festivals. Wailing Wall is the

⁹ There are 1204 Synagogues, 158 Churches and 73 Mosques in Jerusalem. Jerusalem Statistical Yearbook (2000).

second holiest place following the Temple Mount. The Temple Mount is qibla of the Jews. (Hasanoğlu, 2015: 125-128).

Christians: The city has been holy for the Christians for 2000 years. After his birth, Jesus was brought to Jerusalem and he was crucified there. Also Goldgotha is important for the Christians. In its place there is Church of the Holy Sepulchre today. The church is a sanctuary for pilgrimage.

Problems Related to the Sanctuaries

Throughout Jerusalem history, the crucial reason for war has been the possession of the sanctuaries. This matter is also constitutes the focal point of today's confronted problems. Individuals of different religions don't respect for each other. The community capturing the city expels the other communities of different religions from the site they reside and destroy their houses and villages. The community obtaining the dominance prevents the other groups from easily and safely accessing to their own sanctuaries and from worshipping. Holy days and religious rituals aren't taken into consideration. Especiall the dominant one damages and destroys the others historical artifacts, sanctuaries, sites and cultural structures. Such vandalism has been implemented by all the parties. Thus many unique religious and historical values were destroyed and in their places, modern buildings and squares have been constructed.

Diverse institutions, organizations and non-governmental organizations from each communities make efforts to protect the holy sites and religious & cultural values. But there isn't still an entirely impartial and authorized organization for such an action.

Changing the Demographic Structure of Jerusalem

Demographic structure of Jerusalem has greatly changed throughout its history. Efforts to change the demographic components of the city have been always a matter. Demographic information of the city is inconsistent today. But the population settlement policy continues to be the main reason of the disputes.

From the Middle Ages onwards Old Jerusalem has been divided into 4 parts as Jewish, Muslim, Christian and Armenian quarters. The Kingdom of Crusaders Period: Population of Jerusalem increased to 30.000 (1099). The Greeks, Bulgars, Georgians and Armenians etc. were crowded into the city to prevent the Jews and Muslims from coming to the city. Population censuses pre-1905 included the entire region. Population data of the city depended on the estimates (The American Missioners Reports). These estimates suggested that since the Crusades, the Muslims formed the largest group in Jerusalem until the mid-19th century. As of the second quarter of 1800s the Jewish population started to increase and in 1881 was an important

turning point for the Jews. As of the year of 1881 significant amount of the Jews immigrated to the North America and some of them adopted the Jewish Nationalism after they were expelled from the Russian territories in which half of the Jewish population lived. Between the years 1881 and 1914 the European Jews immigrated to the Palestinian territories (Aytürk, 2011: 100-101). In 1891 Jerusalem population was about 45.000 and its population was composed of the Jews above 30.000 and about 15.000 Muslims and Christians in total (Yılmaz, 2009: 473).

Table 1. Annual Population Proportions of the Entire Jerusalem
(www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org).

Year	Jews	Arabs/Muslims	Christians/Other	Total
1844	7,120	5,000	3,390	15,510
1876	12,000	7,560	5,470	25,030
1896	28,112	8,560	8,748	45,420
1922	33,971	13,411	4,699	52,082
1931	51,222	19,894	19,335	90,451
1948	100,000	40,000	25,000	165,000
1967	195,700	54,963	12,646	263,309
1987	340,000	121,000	14,000	475,000
1990	378,200	131,800	14,400	524,400
2000	530,400	204,100	14,700	758,300
2008	610,400	277,200	16,500	904,100
2011	648,900	302,600	16,400	967,900
2012	660,200	310,700	16,500	987,400

In the UN report issued in 1994, according to Israel population census in 1967, the Jewish population was 74%. (Choshen and et al. 2003: 7) 44,000 Palestinians resided in East Jerusalem and 22,000 Palestinians resided in the annexed territories (United Nations Economic and Social Council, 1994). After the Middle East War in 1967 Israel granted the Arabs in East Jerusalem the right to reside in Jerusalem on the condition that they attended to the census excluding the Arabs not attending to the census. In 1988 Israeli Supreme Court decided that the Palestinians had the right to permanent residence permit as per the “Entry to Israel Law” and Israel granted the citizenship right to the Palestinians who made the loyalty oath to Israel and ceased to be a citizen of Palestine (http://www.btselem.org/jerusalem/revocation_of_residency). But most of the Palestinian population rejected to do so¹⁰. In 1993 155,000 Jews and 150,000 Palestinians were counted in the city (United Nations Economic and Social Council, 1994).

¹⁰In the late 2005 93% of the Arabs in East Jerusalem acquired the permanent residence right and 5% of them acquired the Israeli citizenship.

In 1995s residence right of an individual acquiring the citizenship of another state and residing there was cancelled if the said individual didn't return back to country for 7 years. Residence right of the Arabs who couldn't prove that their "real residence place" were Jerusalem were cancelled. Forfeiture of such status was automatic and even the individual could not sometimes find out it. Thus rights of citizenship and residence over 3000 individuals ended. Many Arabs started to return Jerusalem and when it was noticed Israel cancelled the law in 2000 and ceased the policy of "silent deportation". The Ministry of Interior announced that the residence permit in Jerusalem would be regranted to the Arabs on the condition that the Arabs entered Israel once every three years.¹¹ (http://www.btselem.org/jerusalem/revocation_of_residency).

In 2005 mass Jewish migration from the USA, France, Kanada and former Soviet Union was experienced (Central Bureau of Statistics,2006). According to the opinions of opponents of Israel, restrictions in East Jerusalem are resulted from the Israeli effort for Judaization of the city (Adversaries (like B'Tselem organization) against Israeli government). It is difficult for the Arabs to obtain a building permit in the city. Thus the Arabs move from Jerusalem. Even some of the Arabs move to the neighbour Jewish quarters. Most of them migrated abroad because of the economical crisis accompanying the second intifada (uprising) (Palestinian uprising (Intifada) against Israeli capture of their territories. First uprising (Intifada) was experienced between 1987 and 1993 and the second uprising (Intifada) experienced between 2000 and 2005). Furthermore the secular Jews (31% of the Jews) are abandoning the city owing to the increasing prices of houses, employment problem and strict religious environment and they are moving to the coasts offering more suitable life styles and cheap houses. There is a decrease in Jewish proportion and an increase in Haredi Jews proportion.

In 2007 Government of Israel relocated the official organizations there and constructed new business centers and formed Jewish settlement sites for 25,000 individuals to draw the Jews there. According to the data of 2011 population increase rates were as follows: general population increase rate of Jerusalem was 2,1% (16,300), the Jewish population increase rate was 1,4% (7,200) and the Arab population increase rate was 3,2% (9,200) (Choshen et al. 2013:9)

Economic Instability and Poverty

Obstacle before the establishment of peace in Jerusalem is the economic situation, especially unfair distribution of income. Economy of Jerusalem depends on pilgrims. Holy places of Jerusalem are the most

¹¹ Individuals having residence permit could vote in the municipal elections and pay tax even if they aren't citizens.

popular tourism attractions but still religious tourism revenue isn't sufficient. Although the statistics imply the economic growth in the city, development of East Jerusalem is behind the development of West Jerusalem. 78% of Palestinians in East Jerusalem lead a poor life. Although Israel currently celebrates the 45th anniversary of unification of Jerusalem, it is stated in a new report that 78% of Palestinians in the city and 84% of the Palestinian children lead a life under the poverty line. Poverty is increasing in the city, in 2006 64% of the Palestine population and 73% of children were leading a life at the poverty line (<http://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/report-78-of-east-jerusalem-palestinians-live-in-poverty-1.431384>). Such a situation was attributed to the limited employment opportunities, dramatically exhausted education system and insufficiencies of physical and economic infrastructure. Palestinians attribute the increase in the poverty to the city's political practices and Israeli invasion of East Jerusalem.

The Jewish residents are more visible and active from the socio-cultural aspects. But for the Palestinians constituting 34% of the city Jerusalem is an attractive city because it offers more employment opportunities than West Bank or any city in Gaza Strip. About 2/3 of Israelis consider Jerusalem "an ultra-orthodox city" and nearly half of them also consider it poor and 1/3 of them find it "frighting to live" (<http://www.latimes.com/world/la-fg-orthodox5jun05-story.html>) there. Palestinians in Jerusalem may send their children to the schools under Israeli management. But there is only one school in each quarter. Most of them prefer to the schools managed by the churches or Islamic foundations.

Status Problem of Jerusalem

Status of Jerusalem is a significant reason for today's Israeli – Palestine conflict. Each the two states wish to see Jerusalem as their capital.

Opinions of the Party States

State of Israel: After the British withdrawal from the territory it took the control of West Jerusalem in 1948 which was under the sovereignty of no one and in 1967 took the control of East Jerusalem. It determined the new municipality borders and ensured the free access to the holy places. Even if Israel announced that it didn't annexed the city but it only ensured the municipal and administrative unity, with the resolution of the Israeli constitution court it annexed the east part of the city to Israel. According to Israel, Jordan took the control of East Jerusalem in 1948 when it was under the sovereignty of no one. Israel took the control of East Jerusalem by self defence. It has the right over the city. Israeli Prime Minister Netanyahu remarked that "Jerusalem belongs to the Jews and it will eternally remain under the Israeli sovereignty". According to Israel there is no reason for

requiring the status of Jerusalem to be *corpuseparatum*. No international treaty has been made in this field.

Palestinian National Authority: Palestine wish to make East Jerusalem capital of future Palestine State with the name of “Al Kuds”. Palestine remarks that a peace agreement, not ensuring it, won’t be accepted. West Jerusalem must be an issue of agreement. Even if Palestine recognizes the presence of Israel in West Jerusalem, the conflict originates from the Israeli control of East Jerusalem. Palestine deems that East Jerusalem is under Israeli invasion.

In the Taba Summit, held in 2001, Israel firstly talked over the possibility of East Jerusalem’s being of the Palestine capital. Israel never reviewed the issue again because an agreement didn’t made. Israel proposed Palestine that Abu Dis, close to Jerusalem, become its capital. And then the Palestine Authority established Palestinian Legislative Council and Relations With Jerusalem Office there. Ramallah is the administrative capital of Palestinian National Authority. Israel declared entire Jerusalem its eternal capital.

Opinions and Proposals of the Other Nations

Opinions: There are different national opinions on the status of Jerusalem. Most of the nations recognized Israel when it was established. But most of them didn’t recognize Israeli sovereignty over Jerusalem and Israeli possession of Jerusalem. Some nations recognize the Israeli presence in West Jerusalem but they don’t recognize the Israeli annexation and control over East Jerusalem. Generally, borders expansion of Israel deemed contrary to the international agreements. The borders not agreed by the two states aren’t accepted. They are opposed to the new constructions and such actions are deemed unlawful. The USA President Obama censured the establishment of Israeli settlements and destruction of Palestinian houses in the Palestine region.

Member states of UN don’t recognize Jerusalem Law. Thus the embassies are located outside Tel Aviv or Jerusalem (The UN resolution numbered 478). There are international “*sui generis consular corps*” (https://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kudüs%27ün_statüsü). The nations having embassies in Jerusalem specify that they do so for Palestine. There are consulates of the Greece, the United Kingdom, the USA in Jerusalem to render services to the Palestinians. Jerusalem Office of Holland renders services to Israeli citizens.

Proposals: All the nations advocate that the final status of Jerusalem is settled by an agreement made between the parties. They emphasize that the unilateral actions must be avoided. They believe that the problem will be

resolved as per the UN resolutions numbered 242-338. Generally proposals of the nations fall under 5 categories:

It must be an international city under the authority of UN: The United Kingdom (4th Geneva Convention), the Vatican, the USA, Italy

East Jerusalem must be the capital of Palestine: China, Russia¹²

It must be the capital of Israel: Denmark, Finland, Germany

It mustn't be the capital of Israel: Norway, Saudi Arabia, Japan, Canada, Sweden

It must serve as capital city for both states: France

Inconsistent proposals are being made by the USA authorities. The President Bush's statements were against the new settlements and division of the city; 1990 Senate and 1995 Congress statements were for the Jerusalem's being of Israeli capital and against division of the city, 1991 Minister of Foreign Affairs statement was against the Israeli annexation of East Jerusalem, Clinton stated that the sovereignty hadn't been clearly described, Vice President stated that he deemed the "united Jerusalem" capital of Israel. In the UN Security Council the USA abstain from voting the resolutions on Jerusalem.

Solution Proposals and Opinions of the International Organizations

Proposals and Opinions of the United Nations:

UN has many resolutions and proposals having been made for Jerusalem not only in its General Assembly but also in its Security Council. Within the scope of general framework these resolutions can be summarized as follows:

Six of the UN Security Council resolutions on Jerusalem are related to the recognition of Israeli rights over the city. For example, as per the resolution numbered 242: East Jerusalem is under the invasion of Israel. As per the UN General Assembly Resolution: It deems legislatively and judicially imposed laws to Jerusalem by Israel unlawful and invalid and calls for Israel to withdraw these laws. Member States of the UN don't deem Jerusalem capital of Israel¹³ and don't recognize the Jerusalem Law. Member states withdrew their diplomatic representation agencies from the city to react against Israel. No embassies are located in Jerusalem. As per the UN General Assembly proposal numbered 58/292: Palestine has right to sovereignty over East Jerusalem.

The UN General Assembly solution proposal numbered 194: It proposes that Jerusalem is subject to a special international status as "corpus

¹² 2010 Minister of Foreign Affairs "Construction activities of Israel can not be accepted. Such activities may interrupt the peace process".

¹³ Pursuant to the Article 80 of the UN Charter, rights which were granted in San Remo Agreement and League of Nations are still valid.

separatum”. All the member states accept the Plan 1947 proposed by this resolution for Jerusalem and deem Jerusalem an international city. As per the report of The Commission For The Implementation of The Palestinians Non-transferable Rights: It is required that the city remain corpus separatum until reaching a reconciliation for the city. The UN Secretary stipulated in 2009 that Jerusalem serves as a capital city of both states to achieve the peace. Ultimately this is the solution expected by the international platform. 1993 Oslo Accord: It guarantees that the recent status of Jerusalem will be specified on the condition that an agreement is reached with the Palestine authority.

Proposals and Opinions of the European Union

The EU still accepts the Division Plan of the UN. The EU doesn't recognize Israeli sovereignty over the occupied territories and deems Israeli settlements unlawful as per the international law.

Israel was accused of illegal annexation of East Jerusalem by the EU (In the 2009 UN East Jerusalem Mission Report). It was specified in a UN report that Israel increased Jewish population in Jerusalem, weakened the Palestine community, prevented the development of Palestinian city and separated East Jerusalem from West Bank by founding new settlement sites, placing barriers, implementing discriminatory real estate policies, destroying the houses, implementing restrictive permit regime and closing the Palestinian institutions.

EU Ministers of Foreign Affairs requested the EU High Representative in 2012 to issue a regulation on labelling the goods and products of Israeli settlements. It was decided that all the agreements between the EU and Israel couldn't be applied to the territories being occupied by Israel from 1967. A regulation depending on this resolution was issued.

As per the Regulation (The regulation approved in June by the UN Commission and issued by it.), unlawful Israeli settlements in the Palestinian territories as of 2014, West Bank and East Jerusalem can not benefit from the EU aids, funds and scholarships (It includes all the joint EU – Israeli activities including economic, scientific, culturel, sportive and academic cooperation). The EU, announcing that it wouldn't recognize the border changes made on its 1967-borders by Israel, materialized its resolution¹⁴. Israel is required to accept to quit its dominance over West Bank, East Jerusalem and Golan Heights to benefit from the EU 2014-2020 budget donations and joint projects (De Waele, a diplomat responsible for the EU

¹⁴ Netanyahu voiced his reaction against the regulation “We won't accept the external pressure for our borders”.

delegation stated that the EU reflected its discomfort for Israeli settlement activities.) (17.07.2013 BRUSSELS).

2012 EU Report on East Jerusalem: Israeli annexation policy is criticized harshly. Israel is accused of systematically wiping out the Palestinian presence in East Jerusalem and implementing an active annexation policy. In the report it is specified that Jerusalem – Bethlehem line is blocked and two-state solution becomes impossible if expansion of the Jewish settlements in East Jerusalem continues.

In its Declaration of Principles the EU expressed its opinion. The most sound solution is serving of Jerusalem as capital of the both states because of the political and religious concerns of the both states. It was emphasized that sustainable peace wasn't possible without Jerusalem's becoming of the shared capital. It was specified that the State of Palestine to be founded would include West Bank, East Jerusalem and Gaza and borders except for pre-1967 borders wouldn't be accepted unless the both states agreed upon them. It was stated that Israel would divide West Bank into two parts and force the thousands of Palestinians to migrate if Israel created new settlements in the east of Jerusalem. Israeli archaeological excavations in Jerusalem were criticized. It was specified that the excavations made as per the "biased historical documents" in defiance of Islamic holies served the tacit aim of Israel related to making the city eternal Israeli capital without the division of Jerusalem. In the report, members and companies of EU were warned against entering the economical activities that would support Israeli settlements.

As per the EU report published in The Independent, a British Newspaper, (In the report prepared by 25 EU diplomats it is proposed that the EU officials and politicians mustn't visit the Israeli official buildings beyond the "Green Line", when the officials from the Europe visit East Jerusalem, they mustn't use the hotel and transportation services provided by businessmen from Israel) a call is issued to encourage the boycott against Israeli products commercially produced in East Jerusalem and to increase the awareness of people against the products produced in the Jewish settlement. The diplomats request that Israel permits that offices of Palestine Liberation Organization in East Jerusalem, closed in the second intifada (uprising), are opened. The EU diplomats are opposed to the presence of Israeli Security Forces in the Old City and East Jerusalem. Ways to prevent Jewish residents violence in East Jerusalem are sought. It is stated in the report that Israel systematically weakens the Palestinians peresence in Jerusalem, Palestinian neighbourhoods are isolated and the EU has to support the Palestinians. The EU supports the two-state solution.

An Integrated Management Model for the City of Peace "Jerusalem"

An Integrated Management Model

“The integrated management is described as “All the functions which will be formed to plan, organize and control the systems in a manner promoting equilibrium for the opinions, expectations and aims of all segments” (Demirel, 2016: 45). It is a management model which aims at harmonized and mutually-integrated act of more than one social and political actors assembling under the framework of joint conditions. It is a management model where all the segments participate in the management determination in an integrated manner and different opinions are represented. The integrated management is proposed as a management model which gives priority to the sustainable development for the management of geographic areas with various actors and in the axis of integration.

Features of the Integrated Management

Features of the integrated management are as follows:

- a) The integrated management is a wholistic system approach. It considers various issues and problems and their relations.
- b) It requires the coordination between all levels of the state and state organizations.
- c) It aims at long term sustainability and it considers current and future problems, solutions and results.
- d) Management process adopts continuous improvement and development because it is alive.
- e) It is generally requires that the society is educated on their responsibilities because of its crucially important social dimension (Harmancıoğlu et al., 2002: 32).

Steps of the Integrated Management

There steps are proposed for the establishment and action of the integrated management model.

1- First Step: The activity to be made in the first step is to identify the problem. Then diverse aims and choices of the different segments are determined at the local level and within the scope of the integrated management. The integrated management is a complex approach including all the segments of a society, different disciplines and organizations, social, economic, legal and administrative conditions. Thus the abundance of voiced aims makes the work difficult even in the first step.” (Harmancıoğlu et al., 2002: 35). The most important matter in this process is the policy analysis.

2- The second step: This process is the step in which the physical, geographical and technical integration will be realized. In the managements with multiple actors who will have the administrative and financial responsibility may cause disputes. Thus the UN must sustain its presence as

an authority managing the responsibility. This is the mission of the UN and it is the protection of the world peace. The UN must remain as the upper umbrella organization here. The UN must share the authorities and responsibilities among the different segments and ensure the coordination of the management activities.

3- The Third Step: The third step is the step in which the decision-making process and alternative policies can be formed. Risks and uncertainties related to the taken decisions and determined policies for the realization of an effective management must be evaluated sensitively.

An Integrated Management Model for Jerusalem

In this study the integrated management system is proposed for Jerusalem where the three major religions geographically co-exist and the borders of holy places can not be drawn finally and precisely. Decision makers or executors to participate in the integrated management model proposed for Jerusalem: they must be representatives of all religion, local authorities, public professional organizations, non-governmental organizations, universities and research centers and unions and civil society organizations.

Features of the Integrated Management

Strategies for the policy planning and regulation must be dealt with together. Integration of the local organizations will accompany the achievement of the political integration. An integrated political unity is necessary. Integration of the local – regional administrations into the decision-making processes and achievement of official representation of all the political elements at the management level are crucial. To do so, it is required that the different management mechanisms in Jerusalem leave the attitude of identifying each other as the terrorist organizations and meet on a common ground taking the human happiness and human dignity as a basis. Hostility persisting thousands of years must be wiped off. A permanent peace in the international relations must be achieved for the future generations.

From the point of the city culture, it can be ensured that they keep their cultures and values alive by creating Jewish Quarters, Christian Quarters and Muslim Quarters in Jerusalem in a manner of equal settlements as in the traditional Ottoman culture achieving the co-existence of many communities. Such a structure can be achieved with the solidarity, belonging and we-feeling awareness confronted widely in the traditional Turkish cities (Doğan, 2002: 19). A permanent peace can be achieved by developing cultural good neighbourhood relations instead of dominance conflicts

experienced as a result of the inseparable architecture –especially in the holy places- of Jerusalem.

Some problems and disadvantages may be experienced in the establishment of the integrated management and implementation of the model. First of all, not knowing how will be the proposed management model implemented is a significant disadvantage. Presence of multiple actors, multiple aims and their accompanied conflicting aims and policies are the issues making the process difficult. Problem identification process of which realization is proposed in the first step is a difficult step in itself. Problem identification and reaching a solution process is problematic because of the political difficulties and multiple religious borders specific to this issue. Thus aims and policies in the first step must be well-determined. How will be the model stated in the second step put forth in terms of social, economic, administrative and legal aspects hasn't been clearly explained. Such a situation may create a significant handicap for the establishment of the organizations. It is required that smooth information sharing and interactions between the established organizations and current political & social actors are achieved and inconsistencies are eliminated. Division and coordination of responsibilities among the actors is important. The UN resolutions must be considered especially for the achievement of technical and physical integration. Non-infringement of these resolutions by the parties and the actors is crucial. It is required that the harmony among the actors and social harmony are achieved to prepare and implement sound policies in the third step. It is required that awareness of the all decision-makers, society, planners, executors is increased on the life style of the integrated management model. Integrated life style can be emplaced in Jerusalem by education. It will take long time to emplace and accept such a life style and philosophy.

Integrated Management Steps for Jerusalem

1- Evaluation of borders and conditions shaping the policies of different groups and effects of these policies is critical for achievement of the peace and its permanence.

2- Social, geographical, physical, historical, cultural, religious and cultural conditions of Jerusalem must be dealt with in a wholistic approach. Economic, legal and administrative elements must be described and established by considering the holy places together.

While the related organizations of the parties perform their own duties it is required that they undertake the political, economic, financial, technical and cultural responsibilities accompanying the integrated management system.

The UN must preserve its feature of being an umbrella. Existence of an integrated management having multiple actors such as the UN and the EU may achieve the peace. The adaptation of Jerusalem to the integrated management style requires working with more than one actor. This issue should be studied and developed through local actors and UN partnership.

Conclusion

Jerusalem is sacred in the three monothestic religions. The holiest places and values of these religions are located there. Thus each group has wished to acquire the dominance over it throughout its history. The city has always been attacked and all the values of the city, especially its residents, have been destructed and killed many times. Today it continues to be the one of the most risky cities in the world. The city is considered as one of the city's in World heritages in danger by UNESCO because its such a feature.

The human beings must accept that the struggles lead nowhere. Even in some periods different groups or nations gain dominance over the city, the others claims on the city and their seizure efforts always continue and the city will always stay under risk. But these common values of the human beings mustn't be destructed any more. Jerusalem must be a city of world and it mustn't be under control of no state or religion.

Jerusalem is an unsharable city. The reason of it is not only its holiness for each religion and possession passions of each religion but also its physical nondivisibility. Holy places of the city have mixed each other. Also a sanctuary which is holy for a religion is also holy for the other. Al-aqsa Mosque is holy for not only the Muslims but also for the Jews. This is a sign to achieve to live there "in peace". Furthermore the name of the city "Jerusalem" means "peace". All the three religions order to human beings to live in peace. By taking it as a basis, in this study the integrated management model is proposed to ensure that the communities live in peace in Jerusalem.

With the 1993 UN Principles Declaration and 1995 Interim Agreement, Resolutions related the status of Jerusalem delayed to a future time. Status of the city still isn't clear. By the way Israel captured Jerusalem region "de facto" and declared Jerusalem capital. Such an action has caused disturbance in the city. Peace in Jerusalem "must be a real peace achieved between the equals instead of a peace imposed to the weak by the strong by force." (Said, 2002: 61). International community accepts the Israeli control over Jerusalem. However this isn't a solution. In fact, Jerusalem has never been under the sovereignty of a country and the latest dominance over it was the one of the Palestine Mandate of the United Kingdom.

In this study "the international city" proposal for Jerusalem by the United Nations is taken as a basis. This proposal has been developed in the framework of the integrated management system. A management system

reflecting the Jerusalem characteristic with multiple religions and multiple cultures and including all parties and ensuring the decision-participation is proposed. Jerusalem must be a “peace-oriented” city with its autonomous status where each religious and ethnic groups are equally represented. The most successful examples of the integrated management model, the UN and the EU, must undertake active role in the system.

Jerusalem conflict is a sensitive issue. Different individuals perceive Jerusalem in different ways because of their beliefs. Thus the peace is possible only when all the parties, especially the conflicting parties, are satisfied. All the parties must exhibit the required care and effort to achieve a permanent peace. In the management process all the problems are required to be dealt with together by considering sensitivity of the persisting conflicts and suppressed feelings of the past.

Jerusalem must be an “open city”. Call for “open” Jerusalem expresses the requirement for being of Jerusalem a city of everyone. Whatever his/her religion is, everybody may freely enter to the holy places. Holy places and their visitors must be protected against the attacks and disrespectful actions. Worshipping freedom, access to the holy places and protection of them must be assured. Basic beliefs, symbols, rituals and sacred values must be respected and they must be freely performed. Jerusalem having multiple cultures must be told to the communities and understanding on that the city has cultural heritages of the Muslims, Jews and Christians and that they must live there together must be emphasized to the communities. The Jewish – Arabic dialogue must be supported with the joint artistic and cultural activities. In fact the communities co-existing in Jerusalem wish the peace. The Tolerance Monument which is located in the former Israeli-Jordan border is a symbol of the desire of peace.

References:

- ARMAOĞLU, F.(1989) *Filistin Meselesi ve Arap İsrail Savaşları*, Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Yayınları, Ankara.
- ATAÖV, T. (1980) “Kudüs Ve Devletler Hukuku”, Ankara Üniversitesi SBF Dergisi, Ankara.
- AYTÜRK, İ. (2011) “İsrail’de Hristiyan Cemaatler: Devlet ve Dinî Azınlık İlişkilerinin Kurumsallaşmasına Bir Bakış”, *Ortadoğu Etütleri*, Cilt 2, Sayı 2, Ocak, ss. 97-116.
- BINZ, S. J. (2005). *Jerusalem, the Holy City*. Connecticut, USA.: Twenty-Third Publications. s. 2. ISBN 9781585953653, Accession Date: 12 April 2017.
- CHOEN, M., KORACH, M., DORON, I., ISRAELI, Y., ASSAF-SHAPIRA, Y. (2013) “Jerusalem: Facts and Trends”, *Jerusalem Institute for Israel Studies*, Jerusalem.

- DEMİREL, M. (2016) “Su Kirliliğini Önlemede Bütünleşik Havza Yönetiminin Etkisi: Büyük Menderes Havzası Örneği”, Pamukkale Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Yayınlanmamış Doktora Tezi, Denizli.
- DOĞAN, İ. (2002) Korumacılığın Geleneksel Kent Kültüründen Çıkarması Gereken Dersler, Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi, Cilt:35, Sayı:1-2.
- EL-KHATİP, A. (2004) “Kur’an’da Kudüs” Fırat Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi 9:1Çev: Ramazan IŞIK, Elazığ.
- ERTOSUN, E. (2011) “Türkiye’nin Filistin Politikasında ABD ya da AB Çizgisi: Güvenlik Etkeninin Belirleyiciliği”, Uluslararası Hukuk ve Politika Dergisi, Cilt 7, Sayı: 28 ss.57-88.
- HARMANCIOĞLU, N.B., GÜL, A., FISTIKOĞU, O., (2002) “Entegre Su Kaynakları Yönetimi”, Türkiye Mühendislik Haberleri Sayı 419/3.
- HASANOĞLU, E. (2015) “Tanah’a Göre Kudüs’ün Kutsallaşma Süreci” Uludağ Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi 24 (2015/2), Bursa.
- KHAMAIŞI, R. (2007) “In The Shadow of the Separation Wall: Impeding the Right to the City and Shaping the Palestinian Spatial Environment in Jerusalem/al-Quds”, *Jerusalem in the Future: The Challenge of Transition*, Edt: Shlomo Hasson, The Floersheimer Institute for Policy Studies. 63-89 p.
- LAPIERRE, D., COLLINS, L. (1994) *Kudüs Ey Kudüs*, Çev: Aydın EMEÇ, E Yayınları, 3.Baskı, İstanbul.
- Press Release: Jerusalem Day". Central Bureau of Statistics. 24 May 2006
Accession Date: 12 April 2017.
- SAID, E. (2002) *Yeni Bin Yılda Filistin Sorunu*, Çev: Ahmet Cüneyt, Ali Kerem Nuri Ersoy, Aram Yayıncılık, İstanbul.
- TAŞKIN, S. (2013) “Amarna Mektupları Ve Ege Tarihindeki Yeri”, *Arkeoloji ve Sanat Dergisi*, September/December /2013 175-182s. İstanbul.
- "The Realization Of Economic, Social And Cultural Rights: Written statement submitted by Habitat International Coalition, a non-governmental organization on the Roster". United Nations Economic and Social Council. August 3, 1994. Accession Date: 12 April 2017.
- TÜRKAN, A., (2013) “Başlangıcından Günümüze Kudüs Latin Patrikliği”, Milet VE NİHAL İnanç, Kültür Ve Mitoloji Araştırmaları Dergisi, Cilt 10 Sayı 2 May-August.
- YILMAZ, Ö. F., (2009) *Vesika ve Fotoğraflarla Osmanlı Devrinde Kudüs*, Çamlıca Basım Yayın, İstanbul.
- BAROKAS, Y. “Kutsal kentte bitmeyen gerginlik” 19 Novermber 2014, <http://www.salom.com.tr> Accession Date: 12 April 2017.
- BOUDREAUX, R. “Jerusalem: Clashing values alter a city's face” <http://www.latimes.com/world/la-fg-orthodox5jun05-story.html> Accession Date: 12 April 2017.

GILBERT, M. (1994) “Jerusalem: A Tale of One City” The New Republic. http://www.mefacts.com/cache/html/wall-ruling_/11362.htm _____Accession Date: 12 April 2017.

HASSON, N., “Report: 78% of East Jerusalem Palestinians Live in Poverty”, 20 Mayıs 2012 <http://www.haaretz.com> Accession Date: 12 April 2017.

Israel Population 2017 <http://worldpopulationreview.com> Accession Date: 12 April 2017.

Jerusalem Population 1844-2012 www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org Accession Date: 12 April 2017.

Revocation of Residency in East Jerusalem <http://www.btselem.org> Accession Date: 12 April 2017.

SUAREZ, T., 5 August 2010, Visit Abu Dis– site of the future Palestinian capital? <http://mondoweiss.net/2010/08/visit-abu-dis-site-of-the-palestinian-capital/> Accession Date: 12 April 2017.

Sui generis consular corps https://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kudüs%27ün_statusü Accession Date: 12 April 2017.

Taba Peace Talks, <http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org> Accession Date: 12 April 2017.