



**Paper: “Liens ethniques transfrontaliers et activités illicites : une étude de leur interrelation aux frontières Nord et Sud Cameroun”**

**Submitted: 08 February 2025**

**Accepted: 25 March 2025**

**Published: 31 March 2025**

Corresponding Author: Yvan Nathanael Noubissi

Doi: 10.19044/esj.2025.v21n8p149

Peer review:

Reviewer 1: Cyrille Ngon  
University of Bamenda, Cameroon

Reviewer 2: Assana Assana  
Université de Ngaoundéré, Cameroun

### ESJ Manuscript Evaluation Form 2025

This form is designed to summarize the manuscript peer review that you have completed and to ensure that you have considered all appropriate criteria in your review. Your review should provide a clear statement, to the authors and editors, of the modifications necessary before the paper can be published or the specific reasons for rejection.

Please respond within the appointed time so that we can give the authors timely responses and feedback.

NOTE: ESJ promotes peer review procedure based on scientific validity and technical quality of the paper (not perceived the impact). You are also not required to do proofreading of the paper. It could be recommended as part of the revision. The copyrights of the report are on the publisher and the data can be used for research purposes.

*ESJ editorial office would like to express its special gratitude for your time and efforts. Our editorial team is a substantial reason that stands ESJ out from the crowd!*

Reviewer Name: CYRILLE LEANDRES NGON	
University/Country: Cameroon	
Date Manuscript Received: 02/03/2025	Date Review Report Submitted: 10/03/2025
Manuscript Title: Liens ethniques transfrontaliers et activités illicites : une étude de leur interrelation aux frontières Nord et Sud Cameroun	
ESJ Manuscript Number: 0260/25	
You agree your name is revealed to the author of the paper: yes	
You approve, your name as a reviewer of this paper, is available in the “review history” of the paper: yes	
You approve, this review report is available in the “review history” of the paper: yes	

#### Evaluation Criteria:

Please give each evaluation item a numeric rating on a 5-point scale, along with a thorough explanation for each point rating.

Questions	Rating Result [Poor] 1-5 [Excellent]
<b>1. The title is clear and it is adequate to the content of the article.</b>	<b>4</b>
<i>(The title effectively highlights the core focus of the study. It draws attention to the interaction between cross-border ethnic ties and illicit activities. It specifies the geographical context of the research, emphasizing the northern and southern borders of Cameroon, there setting clear parameters for the study and providing a clear significance and relevance of the study)</i>	
<b>2. The abstract presents objects, methods, and results.</b>	<b>4</b>
<i>(The abstract summarizes the objectives, methods, and key findings of the research. It also provides a clear insight into the relationship between cross-border ethnic</i>	

*links and illicit activities in Cameroon. However, it could benefit from more precise language and structure to enhance clarity and flow, particularly in that case the candidate has to refine the presentation)*

**3. There are a few grammatical errors and spelling mistakes in this article.**

**2.5**

*(The text does contain elements that could lead to grammatical and spelling concerns, particularly in its complex sentences structures and technical terminology. Overall, a thorough review and edit targeting grammar and spelling will significantly improve clarity and precision in the writing.*

*1. Complex sentence structure: Pages 01-02 –*

*Original: "Bien que l'on ne saurait totalement responsabiliser ces peuples frontaliers de l'illicite qui s'opère au sein de ces espaces, étant donné que c'est un système composé d'une kyrielle d'acteurs hétérogènes, ceux-ci y jouent tout de même un rôle non négligeable. Ainsi, une meilleure gestion de ces derniers permettrait de réduire ce phénomène aux marges frontalières Nord et Sud Cameroun."*

*Revised: « Bien qu'il soit difficile de tenir ces populations frontalières pleinement responsables des activités illégales qui se déroulent dans ces zones, car celles-ci impliquent de nombreux acteurs diversifiés, leur rôle reste significatif. Par conséquent, une gestion plus efficace de ces dynamiques pourrait contribuer à atténuer ce phénomène aux marges des frontières Nord et Sud du Cameroun »*

*2. Confusing terminology : instead of kyrielles d'acteurs hétérogènes, prefer « diversité d'acteurs »*

*3. Repetition issue: « liens ethniques transfrontaliers » appears multiple times without adding new context.*

*4. Clarity references on page 07: instead of "Ndong Beka (P...), prefer "comme l'indique Ndong Beka (2002), les pratiques..."*

*5. Ambiguity on page 19:*

*Issue: The phrase "jeux troubles des autorités traditionnelles locales" might confuse readers about the nature of the authorities. Suggestion: Clarify this by adding context: "Les interactions complexes des autorités traditionnelles dans le commerce transfrontalier.*

*6. Improper generalizations and lack of specificity, page 22 & 28:*

*Issue: « l'usage de la langue locale » without specifying which language can be vague. Suggestion: specify by saying: "l'usage de la langue locale, comme le fang facilite le trafic illicite à la frontière ».*

*Issue : « configuration socioethnique ». Suggestion: « la configuration socioethnique de ces espaces, qui inclut des dynamiques familiales et culturelles, contribue... »*

*In short, by addressing these few localized issues with pages references, the overall clarity and effectiveness of the writing can be significantly improved, enhancing comprehension for reader)*

**4. The study methods are explained clearly.**

**3**

*(Overall, while the study methods are described, the clarity and completeness could be improved. Especially: the methods section could benefit from more information on how the collected data will be analyzed, like the use of specific analytical framework or software; how the selection of participants for interviews was conducted; the mention of reticence among some participants is good, but elaborating on how the researcher addressed such challenges would provide*

<i>further depth; and discussion of how ethical issues (like consent and confidentiality) were managed during research is notably absent.)</i>	
<b>5. The results are clear and do not contain errors.</b>	<b>4</b>
<i>(The results convey important findings and make logical connections. However, the clarity and comprehensiveness could be enhanced with additional details and a more structured format.)</i>	
<b>6. The conclusions or summary are accurate and supported by the content.</b>	<b>4.5</b>
<i>(The conclusions and summary accurately reflect the content of the study and are well-supported by the findings. They provide a clear direction for understanding the implications of the research.)</i>	
<b>7. The references are comprehensive and appropriate.</b>	<b>4</b>
<i>(The references are indeed comprehensive and appropriate, effectively supporting the framework and findings of the study. They reflect a well-rounded engagement with the subject matter. However, this rating acknowledges the strengths of the references while suggesting areas for potential enhancements, particularly concerning the inclusion of more recent literature.)</i>	

**Overall Recommendation** (mark an X with your recommendation) :

Accepted, no revision needed	<input type="checkbox"/>
Accepted, minor revision needed	<input type="checkbox"/>
Return for major revision and resubmission	<input type="checkbox"/>
Reject	<input type="checkbox"/>

**Comments and Suggestions to the Author(s):**

It may be beneficial to provide clearer definitions of key terms, such as transnationalism and illicit activities early in the paper. This will help ensure a shared understanding among diverse readers. The author could include more details about the methodology for interviews and observations to enhance the credibility of the findings, considering participant selection criteria, the number of interviews conducted, and how data was analyzed. Also, including more recent references or studies or data could strengthen the paper, particularly given the rapidly changing nature of cross-border dynamics, back the borders in question with historical context could help situate the reader and add depth to the analysis. In short, more in-depth discussion on the practical implications of the findings for local governance and policy-making might be valuable. This could provide actionable recommendations for addressing the issue identified in the study

**Comments and Suggestions to the Editors Only:**

### **ESJ Manuscript Evaluation Form 2025**

This form is designed to summarize the manuscript peer review that you have completed and to ensure that you have considered all appropriate criteria in your review. Your review should provide a clear statement, to the authors and editors, of the modifications necessary before the paper can be published or the specific reasons for rejection.

Please respond within the appointed time so that we can give the authors timely responses and feedback.

NOTE: ESJ promotes peer review procedure based on scientific validity and technical quality of the paper (not perceived the impact). You are also not required to do proofreading of the paper. It could be recommended as part of the revision. The copyrights of the report are on the publisher and the data can be used for research purposes.

***ESJ editorial office would like to express its special gratitude for your time and efforts. Our editorial team is a substantial reason that stands ESJ out from the crowd!***

Date Manuscript Received: <b>march, 12<sup>th</sup> march 2025</b>	Date Review Report Submitted: <b>march 18<sup>th</sup> 2025</b>
Manuscript Title: <b>Liens ethniques transfrontaliers et activités illicites : une étude de leur interrelation aux frontières Nord et Sud Cameroun</b> <b>Suggestion : Le transnationalisme ethnique et le développement des activités illicites dans les frontières du Nord et du Sud Cameroun : une analyse corrélacionnelle</b>	
ESJ Manuscript Number: 0260/25	
You agree your name is revealed to the author of the paper: <b>no</b>	
You approve, your name as a reviewer of this paper, is available in the “review history” of the paper: <b>yes</b> You approve, this review report is available in the “review history” of the paper: <b>yes</b>	

#### **Evaluation Criteria:**

**Please give each evaluation item a numeric rating on a 5-point scale, along with a thorough explanation for each point rating.**

<b>Questions</b>	<b>Rating Result</b> [Poor] <b>1-5</b> [Excellent]
<b>1. The title is clear and it is adequate to the content of the article.</b>	<b>Relevant 3/5</b>
<i>(Please insert your comments)</i>	
<b>2. The abstract presents objects, methods, and results.</b>	<b>Acceptable 2.5/5</b>
<b>It is important to begin the abstract with bringing out the aim of the study (the influence of cross-border ethnicity on the development of illicit activities, before the characteristics of the study framework. Then, a brief history and</b>	

statistics on illicit activities in the Northern and southern Cameroon, the study method and the results.	
3. There are a few grammatical errors and spelling mistakes in this article.	Yes 3/5
( ) This manuscript contains mistakes in the style. It is important to polish the style	
4. The study methods are explained clearly.	No 2/5
<i>(Please insert your comments)</i> The method of transnationalism is relevant, but adapted to international studies. However, the nature of this study is ambiguous (between internal study (Southern and Northern Cameroon as the study framework) and international relation (the influence of cross-border ethnicity as a key word). He must show how the cross-border ethnicity influence the development of illicit activities. He should also mobilize the method the use of ethnicity (Philippe poutignat).	
5. The results are clear and do not contain errors.	No 2/5
<i>(Please insert your comments)</i> He should improve the content of the results	
6. The conclusions or summary are accurate and supported by the content.	No 2.5/5
<i>(Please insert your comments)</i> He should improve the content of the conclusion	
7. The references are comprehensive and appropriate.	yes 4/5
<i>(Please insert your comments)</i>	

**Overall Recommendation** (mark an X with your recommendation) :

Accepted, no revision needed	<input type="checkbox"/>
Accepted, minor revision needed	<input type="checkbox"/>
Return for major revision and resubmission	<input type="checkbox"/>
Reject	<input type="checkbox"/>

**Comments and Suggestions to the Author(s):**

He must reorganize the work plan, by bringing the method and the result back to the introduction. Both parts of the plan must show how ethnic transnationalism contributes to the development of illicit activities. For instance,

**I-The ethnic transnationalism: a factor of development of the smuggling of alcoholic beverages and frozen products in the Southern Cameroon**

**II- The ethnic transnationalism: a factor of development of the smuggling of cereals and the cattle in northern Cameroon**

- The mobilization of family ties as a strategy for concealing contraband;
- The mobilization of ethnic transnationalism in the import/export of contraband product;
- The complicity of traditional chiefdoms;
- The complicity of local population ( the refusal to cooperate with the police au behalf the ethnicity.