

Comments to Ahmed and Baloch's paper

This paper aims to examine the underlying causes of underdevelopment in Balochistan from the point view of political economy. This is a new contribution to the field of political economy, in particular related to South Asia region.

The following comments can be use to improve the paper:

1. In Section 3.4, I would like to see the current political structure/institutions and its role in undermining the development in Balochistan. This is not yet fully elaborated by the authors. The authors can also use some models to explain the relationship between federal and local governments such as a game-theoretic or transaction-cost approach.
2. In Section 3.5, I think it is not common to use the United States economy (in this case, GDP per capita) as a comparison to Pakistan, in particular to Balochistan economy. Moreover, both countries have different economic path. I suggest to use some countries which are at the same level of GDP with Pakistan and then the authors can make an argument based on income per capita. Some tables or graphs would make it easier for readers to grasp the points made by the authors about underdevelopment in Balochistan.
3. The authors can also elaborate and make some arguments related to common development goals such as the Millennium Development Goals, and see what the gap is and its causes.
4. Some part of the texts should be considered as footnotes:
 - a. (the opinion is divided on the question that whether Balochistan joined the federation of Pakistan willingly or it was compelled to do so forcefully. For details on this issue see Ahmed, 1975).
 - b. (However, in case of Pakistan and the province of Balochistan, human rights violations have been recorded (see Human Rights of Commission of Pakistan Report, 2014).” (page 2)
5. Some typo errors:
 - a. On page 2, (*In present day Iran*) should be (*in present day Iran*).
 - b. On page 3, “*has\been*”
 - c. On page 4, “*...the treaty of 1876...*” should be the Treaty of 1876.
 - d. On page 4, “*...Balochistan) which...*” should be “*...Balochistan), which...*”
 - e. On page 5, “That is because, ” should be without a comma.
 - f. On page 6, “(il) legal” should be “(il)legal”
 - g. On page 8, “In 2002 the” should be “In 2002, the”
6. I cannot find some references cited in the bibliography:
 - a. Human Rights of Commission of Pakistan Report (2014), cited on page 2.
 - b. Dames (1904), page 2.
 - c. Ahmed (1987), page 2 and 4.
 - d. Dasthi (2012), page 3, and 4.
 - e. Bugti (1996), page 4.
 - f. Nasir (2010), page 4.
 - g. Baloch (1987), page 4.

- h. Pakistan, various issues; FBS, 2006, page 8.
 - i. Grae (2006), page 8.
 - j. Zaidi (2005), page 9.
 - k. Gazdar (2007), page 10.
 - l. WDI (2012), page 10.
 - m. Bengali and Pasha (2002), page 12.
7. The bibliography is unstructured and inconsistent. The authors should use one particular bibliography system. This includes the citation system within the texts.